DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 096 688 CS 201 586

AUTHOR Bowers, Thomas A.; Long, Eugene, Jr.
TITLE The Communicative Power of Advertising Illustrations.
PUB DATE Aug 74
NOTE 26p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Association for Education in Journalism (57th, San Diego, California, August 18-21, 1974)

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.75 HC-$1.85 PLUS POSTAGE
DESCRIPTORS College Students; *Communication (Thought Transfer); Illustrations; *Journalism; Mass Media; *Media Research; *Periodicals; *Publicize

ABSTRACT

This experimental and exploratory study sought to measure the effectiveness of illustrations in selected magazine advertisements. Twenty ads from general interest consumer magazines were systematically selected and photographed on 35mm slides. The subjects for the study were juniors and seniors in journalism and psychology classes at the University of North Carolina. The communicative power of the advertising illustrations was measured by having subjects answer an open-ended question--What is the basic idea you think this ad is trying to communicate? Comparisons of the modal verbal responses and semantic differential mean scores were made between the control and experimental conditions. The results of the semantic differential scales were not conclusive. There were ads in which masking apparently detracted from the ad's appearance, ads in which the masking apparently had no effect, and a few ads in which the masking improved the appearance of the ad. (Author/RB)

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF
EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

ED 096685

"THE COMMUNICATIVE POWER OF ADVERTISING ILLUSTRATIONS"

Thomas A. Bowers
School of Journalism

and

Eugene Long, Jr.
Department of Psychology

The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

A paper presented to the Advertising Division of the Association for Education in Journalism, San Diego, California, August 19-22, 1974.

CS 201 586

The major purpose of an advertisement is to interpret the want-satisfying attributes of the product in terms of the wants and needs of the consumer. In other words, at the base of every ad is an idea that says something important to the reader. The idea can sometimes be communicated solely through the use of copy. It is often the case, however, that an illustration helps the copy and headline communicate the essential idea.

Kleppner, for example, says headlines and illustrations frequently act together and mutually reinforce each other in telling the story of the advertisement. He emphasizes the importance of the illustration:

> "The purpose of an illustration is to convey an idea. The only ideas eligible for use in an advertisement are those that help to express the message the advertisement is trying to convey." (Kleppner, pp. 111-112)

Sandage and Fryburger also point out that the headline and the illustration work in concert to filter out the best prospects for the product and promise the readers a further benefit.

> "Without an illustration in a print ad the full burden of attracting the prospects' attention and getting them to read the copy rests on the headline. In modern advertising such ads are scarce. In most cases the illustration is the dominant element and the headline serves as a caption to add meaning to the picture. In any event, picture, headline, and body text should be interrelated parts and should work together to communicate a unified message." (Sandage and Fryburger, p. 315)

According to Sandage and Fryburger, it is not enough that the illustration merely attract the attention of the reader. It must also be relevant to the

product and relevant to the potential consumers. (Sandage and Fryburger, p. 342)

In another popular advertising textbook, Wright and Warner emphasize the importance of illustrations:

> "A well conceived illustration, however, does more than just increase initial reader attention. It amplifies and speeds up each step in the communication process; it helps shape the tone or atmosphere of the entire advertisement, and it conveys abstract concepts...which are next to impossible to deliver quickly and clearly with the written word." (Wright and Warner, p. 327)

Turning to the evaluation of advertising illustrations, they say:

> "The advertiser, however, cannot measure the value of an illustration in the abstract; he must consider it only as a specific visual contribution to his message...
> ...The first criterion to apply to an illustration for an advertisement, then, is relevancy...
> ...To say that the first qualification for an advertising illustration is relevancy simply means that it should have a traceable and significant connection with the idea the advertisement attempts to deliver." (Wright and Warner, p. 335)

Mandell says illustrations have different purposes: attract attention; demonstrate the product or its effect; emphasize certain features of the product; clarify or illustrate headline and body copy ideas; transmit a visual image of the product, package, or brand name; arouse interest in the advertisement or the product; and stimulate desire.

> "Perhaps the first purpose of the major illustration in an advertisement is gaining attention. Beyond that, however, it should help to create interest--in the product advertised and in the advertisement. Thus, the artwork must be appropriate to the sales objective of the advertisement, and not an end in itself." (Mandell, p. 485)

Dunn echoes the importance of the illustration in the advertisement.

> "We expect the illustrations in an advertisement to contribute to its effectiveness in one or more of the following ways: (1) communicate a relevant idea quickly

> and effectively; (2) attract the attention of the desired audience; (3) interest the audience in the headlines and copy; (4) communicate an idea that might be impossible or even offensive to say in words; and (5) help make the advertisement more believable." (Dunn, pp. 339-340)

In summary, then, the illustration is a very important feature of most advertisements. Its role is usually integrated with that of the headline in attracting readers' attention and demonstrating the product's benefits.

Effective illustrations--those which best convey the essential idea of the advertisement--should meet certain criteria. One of these is simplicity. In other words, the best illustrations are the ones which convey a single idea and which make it possible for the reader to grasp that idea almost immediately. (Dunn, p. 340) Effective illustrations must also be relevant--they must have a "traceable and significant connection with the idea the advertisement attempts to deliver." (Wright and Warner, p. 335) In a similar vein, illustrations must have meaning for the reader or he will not understand the intended idea and the effort will be wasted. (Sandage and Fryburger, p. 340) Finally, the illustration must convey the desired image associated with the product. This is essential because consumers usually buy more than just the product--they buy the image of the product as well. (Wright and Warner, pp. 334-335)

Therefore, an effective illustration is one which conveys a simple and relevant image of the product to the consumer. The degree of effectiveness is the extent to which the reader grasps the intended idea. This exploratory and experimental study sought to measure the effectiveness of illustrations in selected magazine advertisements.

Published research related directly to the question of the communication effectiveness of illustrations is meager. Smith and Engel showed subjects two

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

versions of a car ad--one with a female model used for attention purposes only and the other without the female model but identical in all other respects. They reported that their results "strongly suggest that inclusion of the female model influences peoples perception in various ways." Subjects who saw the ad with the model rated the car more appealing, more likely, more youthful, better designed, more expensive, faster, less safe, and more powerful. (Smith and Engel, p. 682)

In a similar study, Stedman reported that "non-sexual illustrations were more effective in producing recall of brand names than were sexual illustrations and this became more pronounced with the passage of time." This was more true of persons favorably disposed toward the use of sex in advertising. (Stedman, p. 19) The results of the two studies are not as contradictory as they first seem: Smith and Engel measured subjects' ratings of the product's features while Stedman measured brand recall, immediately after exposure and then a few days later.

METHOD

Twenty full-page, 4-color advertisements were systematically selected from November 1972 issues of Newsweek, Sports Illustrated, Woman's Day and Family Circle. These magazines were selected because it was felt they would contain similar-sized advertisements for representative consumer products. Selection of the advertisements themselves was based on the desire to obtain a representative sample of products advertised in consumer magazines and which--in the opinion of the investigators--best lent themselves to the test of the consepts and methods used in the study. A pre-test indicated that subjects could reasonably see and evaluate 20 ads in the regular class period of 50 minutes.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

The subjects were juniors and seniors enrolled in various journalism and psychology courses at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. All students in a particular class were in the same experimental condition. We had no reason to believe that there were any relevant differences between subjects in the two groups. Some subjects in both groups were "advanced" advertising students--taking at least their second advertising course.

The advertisements were photographed on 35mm. color transparencies and projected on a screen at the front of the classroom. In the unmasked condition, subjects were shown the ads as they appeared in the magazines. For the masked condition, all copy and headlines were masked out with black paper on the original ad before it was photographed. The reason for masking of the copy and headline was to ascertain how much "meaning" of the ad was communicated by the illustration alone. The comparison of the modal responses to the masked and unmasked versions of the same ad would give us a measure of the communicatéons effectiveness of thh illustration in the ad. The ads were presented in the same order for both conditions.

At the start of the experimental sessions, subjects were given copies of a questionnaire with a separate page for each of thh 20 advertisements. The pages were identified by number but not by the name of the product. The questionnaire began with three open-ended questions asking the subjects to indicate: (1) the single word or phrase that first came to mind when they saw the ad; (2) the single word or phrase which identified the basic idea they thought the ad was trying to communicate; and (3) the product benefit given the most emphasis in the ad. Subjects were then asked to rate each advertisement on six semantic differential scales: aesthetically pleasing, effective, pleasant, believable, simple, and interesting.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

The subjects were told they would see a series of magazine advertisements projected on the screen and were asked to quickly complete the questionnaire page for each advertisement. Each ad was exposed for 90 seconds. In the masked condition, subjects were also told that the ads had been altered but that they were still to evaluate them as if they were regular ads.

Our data analysis has focused on only the second open-ended question (the basic idea the ad was trying to communicate) and the semantic differential scales. The second question was selected because it matched our interest in measuring the communications effectiveness of the illustration and because our early analysis revealed a close correspondence in the answers to the three questions. The major purpose of the semantic differential scales was to attempt to measure what effect, if any, the masking procedure had upon the evaluation of the ads. In other words, would the masking "mess up" the advertisement and have an unintended effect upon its ability to communicate the idea of the ad?

RESULTS

We analyzed the communications effectiveness of the illustrations by comparing the modal verbal responses of the unmasked condition group to those of the masked condition group. These modal responses were in answer to the question: In a single word or very brief phrase, what is the basic idea you think this advertisement is trying to communicate? Although the question was the same in both conditions, in the masked condition, the question sought responses to the illustrations alone since the copy and headlines were masked. The answers to the questions were combined into the response categories reported below. Also reported on the following pages are the significant differences

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

in the group means on the semantic differential scales. These scales were used to ascertain subjects' attitudes about the appearance and the believability of the advertisements. The statistical test was one-way analysis of variance.

The findings are summarized in Table 1, which lists the modal verbal responses and significant differences in the semantic differential means. These differences are reported in the column in which the mean was higher. Following Table 1 is a brief discussion of the findings for each of the 20 ads. The discussion is intended to be read in conjunction with a visual observation of the unmasked and masked ads on 35 mm. slides. Appendix A describes the ads for readers who were unable to view the slides.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Table 1. Modal Verbal Responses and Significant Differences in Semantic Differential Ratings

	UNMASKED		MASKED	
Johnny Walker Red Label Scotch	"Special, Gift"	19%	"Sex"	28%
	"Good Product"	16%	"Special, Gift"	17%
	"Good Times"	16%		
	"Women"	14%		
Four Roses Premium Whiskey	"Good Times, Fun Times"	38%	"Good Times, Fun Times"	46%
Kool Cigarettes	"Coolness	29%	"Fresh, Refreshing"	39%
	"Fresh, Refreshing"	26%		
Blue Diamond Smokehouse Almonds	"Good Product"	19%	"Compatible"	36%
	"Party Food"	19%		
	PLEASANT[a] *			
Beefeater Gin	"Quality"	31%	"Coolness"	25%
			"Drink the Product"	16%
	EFFECTIVE *			
	PLEASANT *			
	SIMPLE ***			
Chevrolet Nova	"Roominess"	38%	"Family Car"	17%
			"Unknown"	14%
	EFFECTIVE ***			
	PLEASANT *			
	BELIEVABLE ***			
	SIMPLE **			
Marlboro Cigarettes	"Masculinity"	43%	"Masculinity"	61%
Book of Knowledge	"Learning"	45%	"Learning"	51%
	PLEASING *			
	EFFECTIVE **			
	BELIEVABLE *			
Oldsmobile	"Choice"	24%	"Roominess"	16%
	"Roominess"	14%	"Appearance, Style"	12%
			"Travel"	10%
Kodak Pocket Instamatic	"Compactness"	52%	"Memories"	23%
			"Easy"	23%
J & B Scotch	"Warm"	52%	"Warm"	33%
			"Relaxing"	20%
American Gas Association	"Clean"	31%	"Daydreaming, Solitude"	25%
	EFFECTIVE ***		"Unknown"	20%
	BELIEVABLE *			

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Table 1, continued

	UNMASKED		MASKED	
Seagram's 7 Crown	"Fun, good times"	40%	"Fun, good times"	54%
	"American"	33%		
Parker 75 Soft Tip Pen	"Planning & Design"	21%	"Planning & Design"	43%
	"Quality Product"	10%		
	"Precision"	9%		
Raleigh Cigarettes	"Mildness"	19%	"Nature and Outdoors	17%
	"Refreshing"	12%	"Sociability"	17%
			SIMPLE *	
			INTERESTING *	
Viceroy Cigarettes	"Masculinity"	38%	"Masculinity"	51%
			BELIEVABLE **	
Ronrico Rum	"Good Product"	29%	"Strength"	23%
	"Change, Switch"	12%	"Masculine"	14%
	PLEASANT *			
Mercury Montego	"Smooth Ride"	57%	"Luxury & Style"	40%
			SIMPLE ***	
Timex	"Accuracy"	43%	"Modern Beauty"	23%
			"Accuracy"	17%
Rose's Lime Juice	"Good Product"	21%	"Variety and Versatility"	54%
	"Versatility"	19%		
			EFFECTIVE *	
			BELIEVABLE **	

[a] To be read: "Subjects in the unmasked condition rated the ad significantly more pleasant on the semantic differential scale."

* $p < .05$, one-way ANOVA
** $p < .01$, one-way ANOVA
*** $p < .001$, one-way ANOVA

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Johnny Walker. The modal responses for the regular, unmasked slides were: special gift, good product, good times, and women. These were all of nearly equal strength--meaning that their frequencies or percentages were nearly the same. Something happened, however, when the copy and headline were masked out; the modal response of the subjects viewing that version of the ad was sex. This suggests that the illustration was communicating something different from the message of the headline and the sub-head. (In the unmasked condition, subjects were not able to read the body copy of any ad because of their distance from the projection screen.) Since one of the "meanings" or modal responses in the unmasked condition matched the headline idea (a special gift), it seems then that at least part of the meaning of the illustration was dependent upon the cue of the headline. There were no significant differences on any of the semantic differential scales.

Four Roses. The modal response--good times or fun times--was the same under both conditions, but it was stronger (higher percentage) in the masked condition. This suggests that the illustration carries the dominant meaning and it is not dependent upon the headline. In addition, the meaning or most commonly perceived idea of the ad does not match the headline idea--prepare to be underwhelmed. The increase of the strength of the modal response in the masked condition seems to suggest that the presence of the headline in the unmasked ad is detracting from the communications effectiveness of the illustration. In other words, the headline and the illustration are not working together. One could argue, of course, that the headline idea is somewhat abstract and therefore difficult to illustrate. There were no significant differences on the semantic differential scales.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Kools. There was some similarity on the responses to this ad. Freshness was one of the modal responses in the unmasked condition and was clearly the modal response in the masked condition. When the headline--Kools--was masked, the strength of the coolness response decreased. In a sense, then, the illustration was apparently not communicating quite the same thing as the headline. There were no significant differences on the semantic differential scales.

Smokehouse Almonds. There were marked differences in the modal responses for the two conditions: good product and party food for the unmasked and compatible for the masked. None of these responses matched the headline idea of flying to fame on jet airplanes. The significantly higher rating on the Pleasant scale is apparently due to the presence of the masked area on the ad. It is easy to see that it does detract from the aesthetics of the ad. Such effects were by no means universal, however. In many ads, there were no differences and in some the masked version was rated better in appearance.

Beefeater Gin. This was another instance in which the modal responses differed for the two conditions: quality product for the regular, unmasked version and coolness for the masked condition. Neither of those responses exactly matched the headline idea of impress yourself. In other words, the headline and the illustration apparently were not communicating the same idea. The unmasked ad was rated significantly higher on the Pleasant and the Simple scales, probably a result of the masking "messing up" the ad. The higher rating for Effectiveness for the unmasked condition is not as easy to explain. It probably results from the fact that the illustration alone did not carry much meaning and the subjects were confused, leading them to consider the entire ad less effective. It is not certain why this did not occur more often, however.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Nova. This is another example of an ad in which the illustration apparently had little meaning apart from the headline in the ad. The modal response in the unmasked condition matched the headline idea--roominess--but masking the headline and copy apparently caused some confusion in the minds of the subjects, who responded with unknown almost as frequently as family car. It is another case of the intended meaning of the illustration not coming across very clearly. This is reflected, too, in the higher Effective and Believable ratings given the unmasked version. The masking's effect upon the appearance of the ad was evidently reflected in the Pleasant and Simple ratings.

Marlboro. Marlboro ads have apparently earned some sort of universal meaning--masculinity. There is nothing in the headline idea about masculinity but that was the modal response for both conditions. The fact that the strength of the response was higher in the masked condition suggests that the headline was detracting from the meaning of the illustration. It is almost as if people automatically think masculinity when they see a Marlboro ad and a headline such as this one weakens that response. There were no significant differences on the semantic differential scales.

Book of Knowledge. The modal response--learning--was the same for both conditions and the strength was about the same. The fact that much of the copy was superimposed over the illustration meant that the masking greatly altered the ad and probably accounted for the lower ratings on the Pleasing scale. Since there did not appear to be a great deal of confusion about the meaning of the ad even in the masked condition, the aesthetics of the masking apparently accounted for the higher ratings for the unmasked condition on the Effective and the Believable scales as well.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Oldsmobile. One of the modal responses in the unmasked condition--choice--did match the headline idea but the illustration alone apparently did not do an effective job of communicating that meaning, as evidenced by the poly-modal nature of the responses in the masked condition. There were no differences on the semantic differential scales.

Kodak. This is another example in which the modal response in the unmasked condition--compactness--matched the headline idea but the illustration was not very effective in communicating that meaning without the headline. The bi-modal response in the masked condition suggests this. Perhaps the camera should have been shown in a pocket or purse to connote the meaning or idea of compactness. There were no differences in the semantic differential scales.

J & B Scotch. This was somewhat unique among all the ads--the modal response--warmth--was the same for both conditions, but the strength decreased in the masked condition. That response did correspond to the headline idea, however. It suggests that the meaning of the illustration was somewhat dependent upon the headline. There were no differences in the semantic differential scales.

American Gas Association. This ad demonstrated the problem of trying to select an illustration for an abstract concept or idea--a clean environment. With the headline present in the unmasked condition, the modal response matched the headline idea--cleanliness. The inability of the subjects to ascertain even the sponsor of this ad apparently led to the bi-modal responses of day-dreaming or solititude and unknown. This same fact probably accounted for the higher Effective and Believable ratings given the unmasked condition.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Seagram's. The modal response--fun and good times--was the same in both conditions but it increased in strength in the unmasked condition. In the unmasked condition, another common response category--American--did match the headline idea. There were no differences on the semantic differential scales.

Parker Pens. One of the relatively weak modal responses in the unmasked condition--planning and design--was the same as the modal response in the masked condition but that response is substantially stronger in the masked condition. This response matched the headline idea even though it was weaker when the headline was present than when it was removed. There were no differences on the semantic differential scales.

Raleigh Cigarettes. The headline idea--mildness--was reflected in one of the bi-modal responses in the unmasked condition but it disappeared completely in the masked condition. It suggests that the headline and the illustration were not communicating the same idea. This ad is somewhat unique because the masked condition was rated significantly higher on both the Simple and the Interesting scales. Subjects apparently felt the ad was somewhat cluttered with the copy overlapping the illustration and that the masking made the ad more attractive.

Viceroy Cigarettes. The headline talks about taste but the modal responses to this ad in both the unmasked and the masked condition were masculinity, and the response was stronger in the masked condition. The discrepancy between the headline and the meaning of the illustration may also have accounted for the higher Believable rating for the masked version.

Ronrico Rum. Only the relatively weak response of change or switch in the unmasked condition matched the headline idea. That response disappeared in the masked condition, however, suggesting that the illustration was not very effective in communicating this idea without the assistance of the headline.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Strength was one of the bi-modal responses in the masked condition and this is probably an unintended and undesirable connotation for a liquor advertisement to carry. It is difficult to explain the higher Pleasant rating on the unmasked version, since the masking blends into the dark background of the ad.

Mercury Montego. This is another example of an ad in which the illustration apparently did not do an effective job of communicating the headline idea without the assistance of the headline. The modal response of the unmasked version--smooth ride-- matched the headline idea but that idea was lost when the headline was masked. The higher Simple rating for the masked version apparently resulted from the fact that the masking over the lower copy blends into the dark shades of the road in front of the car.

Timex. The headline idea of accuracy was still present in the masked condition, but its strength was substantially reduced. It suggests again that the illustration was not very effective in carrying that meaning by itself. There were no differences on the semantic differential scales.

Rose's Lime Juice. Almost the reverse was true in this ad. The headline idea of versatility was weak in the unmasked condition but became clearly dominant in the masked version. It suggests that the headline seemed to detract from the effectiveness of the illustration. It is difficult to explain the higher Effective and Believability rating for the masked version.

To summarize, in one group of ads, the modal response was the same in both the unmasked and the masked versions, but the strength or frequency of that modal response increased when the copy and headline were masked. In each of these ads, the modal response matched the headline idea. This group included: Rose's, Viceroy, Parker, Seagram's, Book of Knowledge, Marlboro, Kools, Four Roses, and Timex. In one ad--J & B Scotch--the modal response was the same in

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

both conditions (and corresponded to the headline idea) but the strength of the response decreased when the headline was masked.

In the rest of the ads, the modal response was different in the two versions, suggesting that the headline and the illustration were not communicating the same idea. In two of these ads--Smokehouse Almonds and Beefeaters Gin--the modal response did not match the headline idea even in the unmasked condition. In the rest of the ads, the modal response of the unmasked condition matched the headline idea but changed, of course, in the masked condition. These included: Johnny Walker, Nova, Oldsmobile, Kodak, American Gas, Raleigh, Mercury, and Ronrico.

The subjects rated four of the unmasked ads as more effective or more believable than their masked counterparts. Four unmasked ads were also rated as more pleasing or pleasant to look at than their masked versions. Two of the masked ads were rated more pleasing and two were rated more believable or effective than their unmasked counterparts.

DISCUSSION

The results of this study--like those of any exploratory research--are subject to a wide range of differing interpretations. Our present concerns and interests are different from what they were when we began this program of research, and it is likely that the focus will change as we proceed. Even now, everytime we look over the results reported in this paper, we can see new interpretations and new meanings of the data. This is undoubtedly true of everyone who reads this study and is perhaps one of the strengths of this kind of research--it stimulates the exchange of ideas and suggestions for additional research.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

We should re-emphasize that the focus of this study was upon the communicative effectiveness or power of illustrations in magazine advertisements. For one of us, the use of magazine ads held specific interest; for the other, they were vehicles for the study of verbal encoding of pictorial material. At any rate, it is important to keep in mind that illustrations have other purposes besides working with the headline to communicate the idea of the advertisement. Illustrations also filter out the target prospects or attract the reader's attention. Indeed, these may have been the intended function of the illustrations which we found to carry a different meaning than the headline. In other words, we do not intend to imply that all illustrations should work in harmony with the headline. In the same vein, of course, it is also true that some product benefits/headline ideas are more abstract and hence more difficult to illustrate than others.

Speaking of the headline, we soon realized that although we had defined our area of interest to be the illustration, we really could not separate the headline from the illustration. Consequently, we sometimes did not know if we were seeing the effect of the illustration or the headline. One direction of future research might be to test the communicative power of the headline when the illustration is removed--for those cases in which the headline is intended to communicate some idea about the product.

We are still not certain about the unintended effects of masking portions of the advertisement. The evidence from the semantic differential scales was inconclusive in this regard. In some ads, it seemed apparent that the masking did detract from the appearance of the ad; in some it did not appear to make any difference; and in a few cases, the presence of the masking seemed to enhance the appearance of the ad. We are considering other means of removing the influence of the headline or the illustration in future research.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Another possibility for further research would be to examine the relationship between the communicative power of the illustration and its Starch readership score. For example, do illustrations with high Starch scores (generally meaning greater attention-drawing characteristics) communicate the headline idea more or less effectively than illustrations with lower Starch scores?

Finally, of course, there is the problem of realism and external validity. We are aware of the concern in advertising research about the degree of realism in the setting and context of viewing advertising. (Young, p.5) Newmiller specifically studied the effect of the method of presentation--transparency projection versus "through-the-book"--and reported the "evaluation of magazine advertisements on a semantic differential measure is significantly affected by the method used to present the ads to the subjects." (Newmiller, p. 784.)

We felt, however, that the newness of the method used in this study--the masking of the headline and copy--justified the projection method. Our intention from the start was to test the method with groups via projection and then proceed to the more realistic through-the-book method of testing magazine advertising. Then, too, there was the problem of obtaining subjects for experiments in an academic setting. We could not require students to participate in off-class-time and we did not have money to pay subjects. However, we were both able to integrate the experiment into regular class discussions of verbal encoding of pictorial material in psychology courses and creative procedures and advertising research techniques in advertising classes.

We felt more justification when we looked at our results, for the manipulation of the stimuli under the same condition of screen projection did produce differences. Our intention was not to predict the communication effectiveness of the ads and the illustrations but to ascertain if there were different "meanings" of the ad when the illustration had to communicate the message by itself.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

A modest research grant will now enable us to pay subjects and do the testing on an individual basis. This will make it possible to use a more realistic stimulus and setting to test the interaction of the headline and the illustration in communicating the basic idea of an advertisement.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

APPENDIX A

Johnny Walker Red Label Scotch

Black background. Female model holding gift carton of JWRL. Headline at top of illustration reads: "Because You're Mine." Slogan below the illustration reads: "Johnny Walker Red. The world's favorite scotch for your favorite person." Masking does not alter the illustration.

Four Roses Premium Whiskey

Illustration takes up about one-fourth of the ad. Young couple cozily at piano keyboard. Headline: "Prepare to be underwhelmed." Subhead above it reads: "Tired of heavy-handed ideas?" Masking does not alter the illustration.

Kool Cigarettes

Outdoor scene with rainbow. Package of Kools at the end of the rainbow. Subhead at top: "Now from Kool, for low-tar smokers looking for taste." Under that, in largest letters, the headline: "Kool Milds." Subhead below that: "The taste of extra coolness with lowered tar, too." Closing line below the pack: "Enjoy a cooler kind of mild." The product name is clearly visible on the package in the illustration. Since most of the background is dark, the masking does not greatly alter the illustration.

Blue Diamond Smokehouse Almonds

Dish of almonds, two product packages (a can and a box) surrounded by various kinds of drinks, including a pitcher. Headline is small at top of page (copy is at top of illustration): "Smokehouse almonds...They flew to fame on the jets!" The masking does alter the illustration.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Beefeater Gin

Open bottle. Empty ice cube tray, martini pitcher and glass. No copy. Only the headline: "Impress Yourself." The masking does alter the illustration.

Chevrolet Nova

Copy above illustration, which appears to be a typical New England village. Car parked in foreground with hatch opened. A minister, a young couple with a baby, and another woman are standing at the rear of the car. Man is holding umbrella. Between two blocks of copy is an insert showing only the open hatch. Headline at top of ad: "New Nova. With a big back door and a six-foot floor." The masking does alter the illustration.

Marlboro Cigarettes

A "typical" Marlboro ad. Western scene with cattle in the background. In foreground are two men, obviously cowboys. Two Marlboro packs in foreground. No copy, only the headline and the usual cigarette warnings. Headline: "Come to where the flavor is...Marlboro Country." Masking does alter the illustration.

Book of Knowledge

Illustration of little boy squatting and reading volume F of the Book of Knowledge. Shoes and socks are off and beside him, superimposed over part of the illustration is a listing of words beginning with F: frogs, flowers, farms, fossils, feudalism, foreign aid, flouridation. Copy below illustration. Headline above copy: "Kids and the New Book of Knowledge Grow up Together." Masking does alter the illustration.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Oldsmobile

Headline at top of ad: "From Oldsmobile for '73...Two Honest Station Wagons and...(headline continued below illustration)...one little imposter." Illustration shows two Oldsmobile station wagons parked in a field next to a stream. Main copy block is below the main illustration. In the middle of the copy block is an insert photo of the Oldsmobile Omega hatchback. Masking the copy does not alter the illustration.

Kodak Pocket Instamatic

Illustration covering entire ad is upper torso close-up of woman with camera at her eyes, obviously taking a picture. Copy below headline on left side. Next to copy on the right side is an insert--a photo presumably taken with the camera. Headline: "The little camera that takes big pictures." Masking the copy and headline does mask the illustration.

J and B Scotch

Illustration takes up about the bottom 2/3 of the ad. Roaring fireplace in soft-focus background. In foreground is bottle of J and B and a glass with ice and scotch in it. In upper left corner of ad is a sketch of a skier. No copy, only a subhead, "The Pleasure Principle," followed by the headline, "Come out of the cold and into the warmth." Masking the headline does not alter the illustration.

American Gas Association

Headline at top of ad: "More natural gas can give us a cleaner world. But it's going to cost more." Illustration then takes up about 2/3 of the ad. Huge, old tree with little boy lying on one of the branches and looking up into the sky. Closing at lower right: "Gas: clean energy for today and tomorrow." Copy block on left 2/3 of page below illustration. Masking the copy and headline does not alter the illustration.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Seagram's 7-Crown Whiskey

Illustration covers bottom 3/4 of ad. Many people at a political headquarters or celebration, evidenced by flags and posters. Looks like a victory party. Head at top of copy on top of illustration: "Seagram's 7-Crown. It's America's Whiskey." Product is visible in the illustration. Masking the headline and copy does not alter the illustration.

Parker Pens

Illustration covers top 2/3 of ad. Blueprint drawings of pen, with the pen superimposed over the blueprints. Headline under the illustration and above the copy block: "First soft tip pen designed for giving. The Parker 75." Masking the headline and copy does not alter the illustration.

Raleigh Cigarettes

Large illustration takes up about the middle 3/4 of ad. Illustration is of young man and woman outdoors in a field, sitting down. Inset photo of package. Copy insert describes bracelet available for coupons. Headline at top of ad: "Spend a milder moment with Raleigh." Subhead: "Highest quality tobaccos---specially softened for milder taste." Masking the copy and headline does not greatly alter the illustration.

Viceroy Cigarettes

Illustration--a race driver with car in background--covers the entire ad. Headline superimposed over the illustration: "Get a taste of what it's all about. Get the full taste of Viceroy." No copy. Driver has a "Viceroy" patch on his coveralls and a product package is visible. Masking the headline does alter the illustration.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Ronrico Rum

Illustration covers the entire ad. Fist holding what is apparently a daiquiri thrust forward at the reader. Bottle of Ronrico in the background. Headline next to the glass: "Break the Bacardi Habit." Slogan at the bottom of the illustration: Ronrico. The rum with the bright taste." Since the background is black, the masking does not alter the illustration.

Mercury Montego

Illustration fills the entire page, with the copy superimposed. Car is on a road next to a field in which there are several horses. Young couple standing next to car. Across top of ad are five small illustrations, each with its own copy block beneath. This strip describes the filming of the horses. Headline above the car: "We filmed wild horses from a moving 1973 Mercury Montego to demonstrate our personal size car has the ride of a big car." Other copy superimposed over the road in front of the car. The masking of the copy blends into the background and does not alter the illustration. Masking of the headline and the copy at the top does alter the illustration.

Timex Watch

Futuristic illustration of a very large watch on a desolate, lunar landscape between two large crystals. Copy superimposed over the foreground next to the watch band. Large head across top of page: "The Time Machine. $125." Subhead under it: "A micro-computer inside keeps it accurate to within 15 seconds a month." The masking does alter the illustration.

Rose's Lime Juice

Illustration covers entire ad. Bottle of Rose's standing among what appear to be several varieties of gimlets. Head above the bottle: "The Gimlet." Subhead: "Anyway you like it, but always with Rose's." Very small copy below. Masking does alter the illustration.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

REFERENCES

Dunn, S. Watson. Advertising: Its Role in Modern Marketing, 2nd Ed. New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, 1969.

Kleppner, Otto. Advertising Procedure, 5th Ed. Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1966.

Mandell, Maurice I. Advertising, 2nd Ed. Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1974.

Newmiller, Clyde E. "Effect of Method of Presentation on Evaluation of Magazine Advertisements," Proceedings of the 77th Convention of the American Psychological Association, 1969 (Vol. 4, Pt. 2), pp. 783-784.

Sandage, C. H. and Fryburger, Vernon. Advertising Theory and Practice, 8th Ed. Homewood, Ill.: Richard D. Irwin, Inc. 1971.

Smith, George H. and Engel, Rayme. "Influence of a Female Model on Perceived Characteristics of An Automobile," Proceedings of the 76th Annual Convention of the American Psychological Association, 1968 (Vol. 3) pp. 681-682.

Stedman, Major. "How Sexy Illustrations Affect Brand Recall," Journal of Advertising Research, 1969, 9(1): 15-19.

Wright, John S. and Warner, Daniel S. Advertising, 2nd Ed. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1966.

Young, Shirley. "Copy Testing Without Magic Numbers," Journal of Advertising Research, 1972, 12(1): 3-12.